Senior Pastor Pastoral Review

MAYFLOWER CHURCH

Senior Pastor Pastoral Review

Annual Review — Elder-Led, Multi-Source

Review Year	
Review Period	
Senior Pastor	
Elder Board Chair (this cycle)	
Review Meeting Date	

Part A — Introduction

Purpose

This review exists to shepherd the shepherd. It is the Elder Board's primary annual instrument for caring for the Senior Pastor, giving thanks to God for a year of ministry, sharpening his calling, and making sure the pastor is walking with his own Savior while he tends to the congregation.

It is grounded in the conviction that the elders are called to oversee the flock of God which He purchased with His own blood (Acts 20:28), and that the Senior Pastor, as a teaching elder, is himself a sheep under the Chief Shepherd before he is a shepherd of others (1 Peter 5:1-4).

Philosophy

The review is developmental, not punitive. It is a conversation, not a verdict. It honors the pastor's calling, affirms fruit, names growth areas with love, and offers concrete support. No numerical

scores are used. No stack-ranking. No comparison to other pastors. The question is always: Is this man walking in step with the gospel he preaches, bearing the fruit of the Spirit, faithful to his calling, and being cared for well?

Compensation is decided separately by the Board of Finance in the July/August budget cycle and is not discussed in this review.

Confidentiality

Completed review materials are held in the Senior Pastor's personnel file under the custody of the Elder Board Chair. They are not shared with boards, staff, or the congregation without the pastor's knowledge and consent. Pastoral-care concerns arising from this review are held under the ordinary confidentiality of the elders' shepherding work.

Process Flow

1. The Senior Pastor completes Part B (Self-Assessment) and returns it to the Elder Board Chair two weeks before the review meeting.
2. The Elder Board completes Part C (Elder Observations) together in a working session, after having read Part B.
3. Parts D (Staff Input) and E (Congregational Input) are collected in the month preceding the review, summarized for the board by the Chair.
4. The Senior Pastor and Elder Board Chair — and, at the pastor's choice, the full board — meet to discuss all sections and complete Parts F (Pastoral Care of the Pastor) and G (Summary and Development Plan) jointly.
5. The signed summary is filed. A follow-up check-in is scheduled for six months later.

Part B — Senior Pastor Self-Assessment

To be completed by the Senior Pastor before the review meeting. Return to the Elder Board Chair at least two weeks in advance. Be as honest as you would be with your own soul, because you are.

1. Are you using the gifts God has given you?

Where did you see your gifting bear most fruit this year? Where did you feel stretched beyond your gifting in ways that may call for support, delegation, or reshaping of the role?

2. Are you growing in Christ through this work?

How has pastoring Mayflower shaped your walk with Jesus this year? Where has ministry exposed sin or weakness God is working on in you? Where has it drawn you deeper in?

3. Are you bearing fruit where you have been planted?

What fruit have you seen in the congregation this year that you would attribute, under God, to your ministry? What fruit had you hoped to see that you have not? What do you make of that gap?

4. Are you sustainable — body, heart, home, and soul?

How is your body (sleep, movement, rest)? Your heart (emotional health, friendships outside the church, laughter)? Your home (marriage, parenting, the quality of your presence with your family)? Your soul (personal devotion, prayer, communion with God apart from sermon prep)? Answer plainly.

5. Are the elders caring for you well?

This is the question nobody will ask if you do not answer it. Name specifically where the elders have shepherded you well this year. Name specifically where you have needed their care and not received it. Name what you would ask of them for the year ahead.

Ministry Reflection — By Area

Preaching and Teaching

How is your preaching? Are you preaching Christ from all Scripture? Is your study sustainable? Where do you feel you are growing, and where stuck? Consider the pulpit, EQUIP, and any teaching you lead.

Pastoral Care and Shepherding

How are you caring for the sheep? Are you accessible without being consumed? Are the Shepherding Teams functioning under your oversight? Is there anyone you know you have neglected that you need to name here?

Leadership of Staff, Boards, and Teams

How is your leadership of the Director of Biblical Counseling, the Church Secretary, the four boards, the Servants Council, and volunteer teams? Where are you leading well? Where are you avoiding, micromanaging, or carrying what should be delegated?

Doctrinal Stewardship

Has your preaching and teaching been consistent with the church's Statement of Faith and bylaws? Have any doctrinal convictions shifted for you this year in ways the elders should know about? Are you equipping the church to know and defend the faith?

Vision and Mission Alignment

How has your leadership served Mayflower's mission? Where are you aligned with the direction the elders and the congregation have set? Where do you sense God calling us to something new, and how have you been surfacing that?

Self-Leadership and Margin

Did you take your weekly Sabbath? Did you take your allotted vacation? Did you take your study week(s)? Are the office-closure weeks after Christmas and Easter actually resulting in rest for you, or just a lighter load? What needs to change?

Gratitude

Name the moments, people, and works of God this year for which you are most thankful.

Growth Edges for the Coming Year

Where do you want to grow? What kind of support would actually help? What should the elders invest in on your behalf (coaching, continuing education, retreat, sabbatical planning)?

Senior Pastor Signature: _____

Date: _____

Part C — Elder Board Observations

To be completed by the Elder Board in a working session after reading the Senior Pastor's Self-Assessment. This is not a tribunal. This is a group of fellow elders giving an honest, appreciative, and loving account of a brother's ministry.

Preaching and Teaching

Is his preaching faithful to the text, Christ-centered, and fitted to the congregation? Is it helping the church grow in knowledge, love, and obedience? What has stood out this year? Where do we hope to see him grow?

Pastoral Care and Shepherding

Is he a shepherd of the flock, or only a preacher to it? How is he caring for members in crisis, for new members, for the homebound, for the struggling? How is he using and relying on the Shepherding Teams appropriately?

Leadership and Character

Does he lead the boards, staff, and volunteers in a way marked by the fruit of the Spirit? Is he teachable? Does he invite disagreement? Does he keep confidences? Have we seen any patterns of character concern — and have we loved him enough to name them?

Doctrinal Fidelity

Is his preaching and teaching consistent with the church's Statement of Faith and bylaws? Any drift, any new emphases, any pressures from the culture we are seeing him handle well or struggle with?

Family, Sabbath, and Health

What do we see of his marriage, his presence with his family, his Sabbath, his use of vacation? Is he modeling the kind of life we want our people to live? Is he taking the rest we have already granted him?

Vision and Mission Alignment

Is his leadership moving Mayflower toward our stated mission? Where is he pushing us faithfully? Where is he adrift or distracted? What do we need to say yes or no to together?

Governance and Polity

Does he serve as a genuine first-among-equals with the Elder Board? Does he respect the roles of Deacons, Trustees, Board of Finance, and the congregation? Does he use his ex officio access to

committees well?

Staff Leadership

How is he supervising the Director of Biblical Counseling and the Church Secretary? Are they flourishing under his leadership? Is he delegating well, caring well, and holding standards clearly?

Elders' Summary

In one paragraph, what would the elders say to the congregation about the pastor's year, if asked?

Elder Board Chair Signature: _____

Date: _____

Part D — Staff Input

Brief, appreciative input from staff who work under the Senior Pastor's supervision. Collected by the Elder Board Chair; summarized, not attributed, for the review conversation. Not every staff member needs to respond every year.

Prompts (respond to any or all):

- What has the Senior Pastor done this year that helped you flourish in your role?
- Where have you felt especially well-supervised by him?

- Is there one thing that, if it were different in his leadership of you, would make your work noticeably better?
- Are there any concerns about his leadership of staff you believe the elders should be aware of?

Staff responses (summarized by Elder Board Chair):

Part E — Congregational Input (Optional)

At the elder board's discretion, a small rotating sample of members may be invited to offer appreciation and observations. This is not a congregational evaluation — pastoral authority is not a popularity vote — but members often see things elders and staff cannot, and a sample keeps the elders' picture honest.

Suggested approach

- Invite 5–8 members per year, rotating so no member is asked two years in a row.
- Draw from a cross-section: a new member, a long-tenured member, a BFG leader, a teenager's parent, a senior saint, a member who recently went through crisis, and so on.
- Ask a short, open-ended prompt and summarize the responses. Do not share individual responses with the pastor without the member's consent.

Suggested prompt

“We are praying for our pastor this year and want to support him well. What has God done through his ministry in your life or family this year that you are thankful for? Is there anything you think would bless him or our church if the elders took it up with him?”

Summary of congregational input (prepared by Elder Board Chair):

Part F — Pastoral Care of the Pastor

The most important and most often neglected section. To be completed jointly by the Senior Pastor and the Elder Board Chair (and the full board if desired) in the review conversation. This is where the elders remember that they are called to love their pastor, not just evaluate him.

Sabbath, Vacation, and Study Leave

Did the pastor take his weekly Sabbath this year? His full vacation? His study week(s)? If not, why not, and what needs to change — systemically, not just willfully — to make rest possible next year?

Family and Home

How is his family doing under the weight of his ministry? Is his wife known and loved by the elders and their wives? Are his children protected from being treated as ministry assets or ministry burdens? Is there anything the elders should do to bless his family this year?

Friendship and Peers

Does he have real friends, inside and outside Mayflower? Is he in a peer learning or prayer group with other pastors? If not, how could the elders support that?

Mental, Emotional, and Physical Health

Any signs of burnout, discouragement, or depression? Any physical concerns the elders should be praying about or resourcing? Is he connected to a good primary care physician and, if helpful, a counselor?

Professional Development and Continuing Education

What has he done this year to sharpen his craft (preaching coaching, conferences, reading, continuing education, denominational relationships)? What would bless him in the coming year? What should the budget cover?

Sabbatical Planning

When is his next sabbatical? Is it on the calendar? Is the church prepared to honor it? (Even if it is years away, naming it now makes it real.)

Prayer Support

How are the elders praying for the pastor? Is there a regular rhythm for this? Does he have specific requests he wants to put before the elders for the coming year?

Part G — Summary and Development Plan

Completed jointly by the Senior Pastor and the Elder Board Chair at the close of the review conversation.

Gratitude — What God did this year

One to three paragraphs naming the clearest evidences of God's grace in and through the pastor's ministry this year.

Affirmations

Specific things the elders want the pastor to keep doing, keep leaning into, or keep being. Name them clearly so he remembers them the next time he doubts his calling.

Growth Areas

Two to four concrete areas for growth, named with love. Not a laundry list. What would most bless him and the church to work on?

Development Plan for the Coming Year

For each growth area above, name: the practice or resource, the support from the elders, and a simple way to know it happened.

Asks of the Elder Board

What the pastor is asking the elders to do for him this year — specifically, tangibly, and in writing.

Asks of the Senior Pastor

What the elders are asking the pastor to commit to this year — specifically, tangibly, and in writing.

Follow-Up

A six-month check-in between the Senior Pastor and the Elder Board Chair is scheduled for:

_____

Signatures

Senior Pastor: _____

Elder Board Chair: _____

Date of Review Meeting: _____

Filed in the Senior Pastor's personnel file under the custody of the Elder Board Chair.

Revision #2
Created 2026-04-25 23:56:17 UTC by Anton Brown
Updated 2026-07-23 10:48:54 UTC by Anton Brown